

Utah Review: Clinical Practice Guidelines: Johnston

Johnston Item	Utah Review
1. Define the Research Question	
1.1 Use the PICAR framework (Population, Intervention, Comparator, Attributes, Recommendations).	No
1.2 Clearly define the scope and objectives of the review.	No
2. Develop a Protocol	
2.1 Outline inclusion/exclusion criteria, search strategy, and data extraction methods.	Not specifically for CPGs
2.2 Register the protocol in PROSPERO or publish it for transparency.	No
3. Literature Search	
3.1 Search multiple databases (e.g., PubMed, Embase, Cochrane Library).	Only in PubMed, Embase.
3.2 Include gray literature (e.g., government reports, society guidelines).	No
3.3 Consult an information specialist to refine the search strategy.	No
4. Screening and Selection of Guidelines	
4.1 Apply predefined eligibility criteria.	No
4.2 Use two independent reviewers for screening titles, abstracts, and full texts.	Yes
4.3 Retrieve companion documents (e.g., methodology supplements, updates).	No
5. Quality Assessment	
5.1 Use validated tools like AGREE II or DELBI.	No
5.2 Evaluate CPGRs separately if applicable.	No
6. Data Extraction	
6.1 Extract key data: guideline characteristics, recommendations, supporting evidence.	No
6.2 Use standardized forms and ensure double-checking for accuracy.	No

7. Data Synthesis and Analysis	
7.1 Conduct descriptive analysis of guideline characteristics.	Yes
7.2 Perform meta-synthesis of recommendations if applicable.	No
7.3 Identify gaps, inconsistencies, and trends across guidelines.	No
8. Reporting and Interpretation	
8.1 Follow PRISMA guidelines for transparent reporting.	Yes
8.2 Discuss implications, limitations, and future research directions.	No
8.3 Engage stakeholders for practical application.	No

There are weaknesses in all domains and in all but three subdomains (4.2, 7.1, 8.1)